

Minutes of the Board Meeting of the
Interim Haiti Recovery Commission (IHRC)

Monday, 28 February 2011
Hotel Karibe, Pétionville, Haiti

Present: Annex I lists the Board members and other persons present at the Board meeting. Also present at the Board meeting were certain Board members' advisors, who are not reflected in these minutes. Also present at the Board meeting were members of the press, who are not reflected in these minutes.

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting of the Board ("Board") of the Interim Haiti Recovery Commission ("IHRC") was called to order at approximately 1:30 p.m. by Prime Minister Bellerive and President Clinton, who served as Co-Chairs of the meeting. All persons participating in the meeting were able to communicate with each other. A quorum of Board members was present.

OPENING REMARKS

Prime Minister Bellerive welcomed Board members to the fifth Board meeting of the IHRC. He introduced two new Board members: Conrad Sauvé, representing the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and Saint-Juste Momprévil, representing the Executive Branch of the Government of Haiti ("GOH"). He also introduced Arturo Reig, who replaced Cristina Barrios as the Board member representing Spain.

Prime Minister Bellerive noted that the Board held a special meeting with representatives of the two Haitian presidential candidates on 15 February 2011. He emphasized the need to integrate the work of the IHRC with the government to be formed by the candidate that prevails.

Prime Minister Bellerive summarized the ongoing challenges that the IHRC faces and outlined certain recent achievements of the IHRC. Finally, Prime Minister Bellerive indicated that the IHRC had been working on improving its efficiency and communications with Board members and key constituents. He said that the IHRC recently held outreach meetings with Haitian Board members and representatives of the private sector and that similar outreach meetings will continue. He encouraged Board members to ask questions and make suggestions, so that the IHRC will continue to improve during the remainder of its mandate.

President Clinton next made opening remarks. He said that the primary goal at this meeting was to accelerate the pace of implementing projects approved by the Board and thus demonstrate tangible results. He summarized the positive impacts that would be accomplished by the approval of the 13 proposed projects. President Clinton also said that a total of 74 projects, with an aggregate value of \$3 billion, had been approved by the IHRC to date. However, he said that of the funds pledged for fiscal years 2010 and 2011, only \$1.38 billion, or 30.5%, of pledges had been disbursed. He summarized the approved projects that remain unfunded or partially funded and urged support for those projects.

President Clinton recognized the Governments of Japan and Spain, who responded to the call at the December Board meeting for donor support to the Haiti Reconstruction Fund (the “HRF”) by pledging an addition \$30 million each. He said that there would be a special signing ceremony with representatives of Japan and Spain immediately following the Board meeting.

STRATEGIC PLAN IMPLEMENTATION

President Clinton summarized the status of the implementation of the strategic plan presented at the 14 December 2010 Board meeting, pointing out achievements that had been made and needs that were still unmet. Prime Minister Bellerive noted that the GOH fully supports the implementation of the strategic plan. He introduced Gabriel Verret, the Executive Director of the IHRC, who gave a presentation regarding the implementation of the strategic plan. Henry-Robert Louis assisted with the presentation.

Following the presentation, Mr. Verret said that there would be five sector-specific presentations at this meeting, corresponding to five of the eight priority sectors outlined in the strategic plan. He said that the remaining three sectors would make presentations at the next Board meeting.

Debris Removal

Mr. Verret first introduced Shannon Rogers, the IHRC’s debris removal sector leader, who gave a presentation on debris removal.

After Ms. Rogers’ presentation, President Clinton noted that Ms. Rogers had indicated that there were no guidelines regarding how rubble can be used in construction. He suggested that the IHRC staff prepare guidelines to be presented to the GOH and then to the Board. He encouraged anyone with relevant experience to participate in this effort.

Certain Board members, including David Moloney (Canada), Rebeca Grynspan (United Nations Development Programme (“UNDP”)), Rose-Anne Auguste (Haitian NGOs), Marie George Salomon (Executive Branch of the GOH), Raoul Pierre-Louis (Haitian local authorities), Gary Lissade (Judicial Branch of the GOH), Cheryl Mills (United States) and Antonio Ferreira Simoes (Brazil) commented on the debris removal presentation.

In response to Board members’ comments and questions, Ms. Rogers said that the need for more debris dump sites, rather than the availability of equipment or labor, would be the primary constraint on debris removal when the effort is fully funded. Ms. Rogers discussed the need for additional dump sites, and their potential costs and locations, with the Board members. She also discussed potential recycling of the debris and its use in construction.

Housing

Mr. Verret next introduced Priscilla Phelps, the IHRC’s housing sector leader, who gave a presentation on housing.

Prime Minister Bellerive raised a question regarding the construction of housing for people living in the camps and how it might impact the rural population. He asked whether such reconstruction efforts could result in the movement of more people to the camps. Ms. Phelps indicated that options were being discussed with mayors, and that one approach would be to reconstruct in a manner that would integrate different income levels in the same neighborhoods.

She said that they were thinking through land uses, community development, neighborhood types and transportation, among other issues, in addressing housing, and that the goal was not to rebuild neighborhoods as they were before, but rather to make them safer, more accessible and with better access to services.

Certain Board members, including George Henry Fils (Judicial Branch of the GOH), Pierre Duquesne (France), Rose-Anne Auguste (Haitian NGOs), Marie George Salomon (Executive Branch of the GOH), Earl Huntley (replacing P.J. Patterson as the Board member representing CARICOM), Philippe Becoulet (International NGOs), Conrad Sauv  (International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies), Antonio Ferreira Simoes (Brazil) and Claude Jeudy (Executive Branch of the GOH) commented on the housing presentation. Prime Minister Bellerive noted that the GOH had created a housing committee, which was working with Ms. Phelps on the issues she discussed. Ms. Auguste mentioned her proposal that “*villages de vie*” be constructed to house the people living in the camps, and said that she had previously submitted a presentation to the Co-Chairs regarding this suggestion.

Prime Minister Bellerive stated that the IHRC had been working with private banks and the GOH regarding housing financing. President Clinton noted that one project proposed for approval at the meeting intended to set up a mortgage market for people with limited income for whom normal banks were too expensive. He said he hoped that donors’ funds would be used not just for housing reconstruction, but also to create the first mortgage system in Haiti. He said that Board member R ginald Boulos (Haitian business community) had been working on this issue. Mr. Jeudy indicated that he would be pleased to be a part of any committee working on the issue.

President Clinton next said that the Board meeting was running long and that, as a result, the health sector presentation by Dr. Claire Pierre, the IHRC’s health sector leader, would take place at the next Board meeting.

Water and Sanitation

Mr. Verret next introduced Dominique Bouzerma, the IHRC’s water and sanitation sector leader, who gave a presentation on water and sanitation.

Board member Arturo Reig (Spain) commented on the water and sanitation presentation, noting his concern about the cholera situation and that he was looking forward to the health presentation at the next Board meeting. He also stressed (1) the effort that his country has made in that area, including Spain’s contribution of 120 million Euros from the Cooperation Fund and other multilateral contributions, (2) Spain’s concern about the fact that the work on the sewage treatment station in Titanyen had been put on hold, and (3) the Spanish Government’s satisfaction with the alternative proposal presented verbally by the Government of Haiti, with respect to which Spain expects to receive a formal proposal soon.

Energy

Mr. Verret next introduced Lumas Kendrick, the IHRC’s energy sector leader, who gave a presentation on energy.

Certain Board members, including Antonio Ferreira Simoes (Brazil), Gary Lissade (Judicial Branch of the GOH), Joseph Bernadel (Haitian diaspora), Alexandre Abrantes (World

Bank), Jean-Claude Lebrun (Haitian labor unions) and Réginald Boulos (Haitian business community) commented on the energy presentation.

Board members noted that there was often a lack of communication between project proponents and the IHRC Secretariat after projects were approved, especially in the energy sector, and that communication between the private sector and the IHRC Secretariat needs improvement. Mr. Kendrick said that he understood the frustrations expressed and that the energy sector team was working to improve communications with project proponents. Board members also raised concerns about the prevalence of illegal use of energy in Haiti and asked about telecommunications projects. In addition, Mr. Abrantes suggested that a roundtable discussion be convened for Board members to discuss and debate energy policy.

Prime Minister Bellerive next introduced Yves Bastien from the Commission for the Modernization of Public Enterprises ("CMEP") of the GOH to give a presentation on behalf of the GOH regarding the energy sector.

Board member Georges Henry Fils (Judicial Branch of the GOH) mentioned the need for Haiti to develop a market for energy and said he would like more information on how the energy market would work. Mr. Bastien noted that there were additional materials in Board members' meeting books that were not presented.

Mr. Verret encouraged Board members to contact the IHRC Secretariat with questions and comments regarding the sector presentations.

DISCUSSION OF IHRC GOVERNANCE AND RELATED ISSUES

Board member Jean-Claude Lebrun (Haitian labor unions) raised the topic of IHRC governance issues. He mentioned the concerns raised by Haitian Board members at the 14 December 2010 Board meeting regarding a lack of communication with, and support from, the IHRC Secretariat. He said that a big effort had been made by the IHRC, but that that effort should be consolidated and strengthened. He said that the supplemental information provided to Haitian Board members should also be provided to the other Board members and to the Haitian people. Mr. Lebrun said that Board members receive calls from project proponents asking for more information about the status of projects. He said that there should be more discussion about the projects between the Board, the Co-Chairs and the IHRC Secretariat, so that Board members are in a better position to respond to questions from the community.

Board member Elisabeth Slattum (Norway) raised two cross-cutting issues to be integrated into the work of the IHRC. First, she said that a gender expert was now working with the IHRC to ensure that gender considerations were taken into account in connection with all projects. Second, she said that human rights should be a key focus in building Haiti back better. She said that the integration of human rights into the reconstruction efforts should be a topic of discussion for the Board and should be placed on the agenda for the next Board meeting.

DONOR FUNDING ANALYSIS

Mr. Verret said that the scheduled donor funding presentation would be deferred until the next Board meeting. He encouraged Board members to review the presentation on donor funding in their meeting packets in advance of the next Board meeting.

PRESENTATION BY GRAHN-MONDE

Prime Minister Bellerive next introduced Dr. Samuel Pierre of GRAHN-Monde (*Groupe de Réflexion and d'Action pour une Haïti Nouvelle*). Dr. Pierre made a special presentation to the Board regarding GRAHN-Monde's vision for a new Haiti.

Certain Board members, including Joseph Bernadel (Haitian diaspora), Ricardo Seitenfus (Organization of American States), Gary Lissade (Judicial Branch of the GOH) and Rose-Anne Auguste (Haitian NGOs) thanked Dr. Pierre and his collaborators for their work and commented on the presentation. Dr. Pierre responded to questions raised by Board members. Mr. Bernadel introduced his colleague, Myrtha Désulmé, a representative of the Haitian diaspora in the Caribbean and Latin America. He indicated that a "*maison de la diaspora*" would be established this year in Haiti, and that the diaspora representatives had launched several initiatives to assist with reconstruction. Prime Minister Bellerive indicated that the IHRC would continue the dialogue with GRAHN, as well as with the whole Haitian diaspora.

INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND PRESENTATION – MACROECONOMIC OVERVIEW

Prime Minister Bellerive next introduced Jacques Bouhga-Hagbe of the International Monetary Fund ("IMF"), who presented the IMF's assessment of the current economic situation in Haiti. After the presentation, Prime Minister Bellerive invited Ronald Baudin, Minister of Economy and Finance of the GOH, to make remarks. Mr. Baudin thanked Mr. Bouhga-Hagbe for his presentation. He commented on the macroeconomic situation in Haiti and raised concerns regarding the level of budget assistance pledged to the GOH by donors versus the amount of such budget assistance received to date. He encouraged donors not to wait until the next government was in place to provide their pledged budget assistance.

Certain Board members, including Cheryl Mills (United States), David Moloney (Canada), Pierre Duquesne (France), Claude Jeudy (Executive Branch of the GOH), Georges Henry Fils (Judicial Branch of the GOH) and Lut Fabert-Goossens (European Union) commented on the macroeconomic presentations. Ms. Mills raised questions regarding GOH capital expenditures and asked whether capital expenditure projects – historical, year to date, and expected – could be detailed on the Ministry's website. She also asked whether the increased revenues were expected to continue. Mr. Baudin said that the capital expenditure data was on the Ministry's website and that, in response to Ms. Mills's other questions, he would provide her with more information and would be available to discuss with her. Mr. Moloney emphasized the importance of the GOH establishing an appropriate tax base and collecting taxes effectively, so that would be the basis for future GOH funding rather than budget support from donors. Mr. Duquesne said that donors need to know whether the new government will continue the efforts at transparency implemented by the current government. He also raised concerns about the impact of rising oil prices, given that the GOH subsidizes the cost of gas. Ms. Fabert-Goossens requested that a presentation be communicated to the IHRC Board members on the alignment of IHRC priorities within the budget of the GOH. Mr. Baudin responded to the comments and questions raised by Board members.

OTHER BUSINESS

Ratification of the Minutes of 14 December 2010 Board Meeting

Prime Minister Bellerive indicated that the minutes of the 14 December 2010 Board meeting had already been approved by the Board members by written consent as permitted by the Bylaws.

Board member Rose-Anne Auguste (Haitian NGOs) stated that she had sent comments to be included in the 14 December 2010 Board meeting minutes to Mr. Verret several times, but that she had not received a response. Prime Minister Bellerive said that Ms. Auguste's comments would be annexed to the 14 December 2010 Board meeting minutes.

Approval of Proposed Programs and Projects

Prime Minister Bellerive said that the Board would next vote on the projects recommended for Board approval, which were described in more detail in the Board members' meeting materials. Board member Pierre Duquesne (France) said that Board members had received the meeting materials somewhat earlier than in the past, but still too late in his opinion. He said that some of the project materials lacked basic information, including the concept notes, and that he had questions about some of the proposed projects. Board member Rose-Anne Auguste (Haitian NGOs) offered numerous comments on the projects proposed for approval. Ms. Auguste's comments on the proposed programs and projects, along with comments from other Board members received in advance of the Board meeting, are attached hereto as Exhibit B.

Prime Minister Bellerive responded to Mr. Duquesne's comments on the timing of the distribution of materials, noting that the materials were distributed to Board members on 21 February 2011. He stated that if the Board wishes to have meetings frequently, in order to have time to process projects and prepare materials, materials must by necessity be distributed to Board members not too far in advance of a Board meeting.

Board member Alexandre Abrantes (World Bank) raised a question regarding which projects are sent to the HRF for financing. He noted that one of the projects presented for approval and submission to the HRF did not have a partner entity and another had a partner entity still under negotiation. He asked whether the Board should wait to send those projects to the HRF until after the projects have clear partner entities. Other Board members, including Cheryl Mills (United States), Antonio Ferreira Simoes (Brazil) and Lut Fabert-Goossens (European Union) echoed the view expressed by Mr. Abrantes. Mr. Verret said that projects are not sent to the HRF only when they are ready – they are sent to the HRF after they are approved by the IHRC based on their technical merit. He said that it was then up to the HRF to match the projects, partners and funding. Prime Minister Bellerive said that he would discuss the matter with the IHRC Secretariat and proposed that the Board approve all of the projects but wait to send the project without a partner to the HRF when it has a partner.

While acknowledging that the IHRC Secretariat had improved its distribution of materials, Board member Rebeca Grynspan (UNDP) asked the IHRC Secretariat to make available to Board members more information regarding the project approval process. Board member David Moloney (Canada) also said that the IHRC Secretariat should send the project concept notes and additional summary materials to Board members.

A motion was made and seconded to ratify the projects presented to the Board for approval. The Board approved and adopted the following resolution:

RESOLVED, that the Board hereby approves all of the programs and projects set forth on Exhibit A as described in the materials provided to the Board on 21 February 2011, subject to implementation in accordance with IHRC guidelines.

The resolution was approved by a majority of Voting Board Members in attendance, with three (3) voting Board members in attendance abstaining, and zero (0) voting Board members in attendance opposed. Board member Rebeca Grynspan (UNDP) recused herself from the vote on those programs and projects described on Exhibit A with respect to which the United Nations has an interest. Board member Alexandre Abrantes (World Bank) abstained from the vote in order to avoid any potential conflict of interest.

OPERATIONAL PROGRESS

Mr. Verret next gave a brief presentation regarding the operational progress made by the IHRC Secretariat, in particular in the areas of human resources and budget and finances.

Board member Joseph Bernadel (Haitian diaspora) requested a meeting between delegates from the diaspora and Mr. Verret regarding outreach. He said that he would suggest three dates and let Mr. Verret choose from among those dates.

PERFORMANCE AND ANTI-CORRUPTION OFFICE

Prime Minister Bellerive next summarized the bid process pursuant to which a firm had been selected to implement the Performance and Anti-Corruption Office (the "PAO"). He said that PricewaterhouseCoopers ("PwC") had been selected by a committee of Board members to implement the PAO and that representatives of PwC were in attendance at the Board meeting.

Board member Pierre Duquesne (France) voiced his concerns regarding the selection of PwC. He said that, during earlier Board discussions regarding the PAO, it was agreed that the Board would be informed of the PAO selection activities. He said that the Board had not been kept informed about the bid and selection results as promised until now. He reiterated his concern, raised since August, that he did not see how the firm that had created the PAO concept could be permitted to participate in the bid to do the work. He expressed his opinion that this represented a pure conflict of interest which damages the integrity of the office. Mr. Duquesne reminded Board members that the PAO budget represented 26% of the IHRC budget. He proposed that the Board reopen the selection process and expressed his desire that the profound disagreement of his country with the selection process and its results be registered in the minutes of the Board meeting.

Prime Minister Bellerive and Mr. Verret responded to Mr. Duquesne's comments. Mr. Verret summarized the selection process through which PwC was awarded the contract. He said that, when PwC agreed to provide *pro bono* services for the IHRC after the earthquake, it did so with the understanding that it would be allowed to bid for any work that was later open for bidding. He also said that a candidate for PAO Director had been identified and could be in place soon. Prime Minister Bellerive noted the strong objection raised by Mr. Duquesne on behalf of France.

Rose-Anne Auguste (Haitian NGOs), a member of the PAO selection panel, responded to the concerns raised by Mr. Duquesne. She said that she had participated on the PAO selection panel as an IHRC Board member and that she had been involved in all stages of the selection process from beginning to end. Ms. Auguste noted that the open bid procurement process had been facilitated by a law firm with experience in similar matters. She said that the process was transparent, objective and judicious and that it had been well documented.

Ms. Auguste said that she believes that the firm selected, PwC, has the technical ability and relevant experience from working on similar mandates to meet the requirements of the IHRC. She said that, from her perspective, it was important to emphasize the participation of competent and qualified Haitian resources. Ms. Auguste said further that strengthening the institutional capacity of Haitian resources was a highly relevant criterion for the selection committee in evaluating the proposals. She said that PwC had demonstrated a convincing strategy for strengthening Haitian capacities.

CLOSING

Prime Minister Bellerive noted that it was 8:40 p.m. and suggested that if Board members had any further comments or concerns, they should send those to the Executive Director or the IHRC Secretariat.

Board member Elisabeth Slattum (Norway) suggested that, for the next meeting, it would be advisable to schedule a full day or two days of meetings and working groups, so as not to rush through consideration of important issues. President Clinton summarized the matters discussed at the Board meeting, said that the next Board meeting would be scheduled for a full day on 8 April 2011 and said that it would coincide with a donor conference being co-hosted by the IHRC and the United Nations.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at approximately 8:45 p.m.

Prime Minister Bellerive
Co-Chair

President Clinton
Co-Chair

**ANNEX I
BOARD MEMBERS ATTENDING 28 FEBRUARY 2011 MEETING**

Prime Minister Bellerive	Co-Chair
President Clinton	Co-Chair
Lucien Jean Bernard	Senate of Haiti
Lucien Francoeur	Chamber of Deputies of Haiti
Jean Rénaud Clérismé	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Claude Jeudy	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Marie George Salomon	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Saint-Juste Momprévil	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Georges Henry Fils	Judicial Branch of Government of Haiti
Gary Lissade	Judicial Branch of Government of Haiti
Raoul Pierre-Louis	Haitian Local Authorities (CASECS)
Jean-Claude Lebrun	Haitian Labor Unions
Suze Percy Filippini*	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Jean-Marie Bourjolly*	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Réginald Boulos	Haitian Business Community
Major Joseph G. Bernadel	Haitian Diaspora
Carmèle Rose-Anne Auguste	Haitian NGOs
Earl Huntley	CARICOM
Luis Alberto Moreno	Inter-American Development Bank
Rebeca Grynspan	United Nations Development Programme
Alexandre Abrantes	World Bank
Antonio Ferreira Simoes	Brazil
Lut Fabert-Goossens	European Union
Cheryl Mills	United States
Elisabeth Slattum	Norway
Maria Mendoza Ortega	Venezuela
Pierre Duquesne	France
Arturo Reig	Spain
David Moloney	Canada
Kentaro Minami	Japan
Conrad Sauvé	International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies
Ricardo Seitenfus	Organization of American States
Philippe Bécoulet	International NGOs

* By proxy granted to Georges Henry Fils.

Also present at the invitation of the Co-Chairs were:

Gabriel Verret	Executive Director of the IHRC
Priscilla Phelps	IHRC (Housing)
Shannon Rogers	IHRC (Debris Removal)
Dr. Claire Cécile Pierre	IHRC (Health)
Dominique Bouzerma	IHRC (Water and Sanitation)
Lumas Kendrick	IHRC (Energy)
Henry-Robert Louis	Government of Haiti

Ronald Baudin

Yves Bastien

Dr. Samuel Pierre

Jacques Bouhga Hagbe

Cristina Barrios

Ruben Silie Valdez

Ricardo Garcia Napoles

Michèle Oriol

Laura Graham

Worth MacMurray, David Jansen
& William MacMillan

Mireille Mérové-Pierre

T. Clark Weymouth

& Jean Blackerby

Government of Haiti (Minister of Economy &
Finance)

Government of Haiti (CMEP)

GRAHN-Monde

IMF

Spain (former Board member)

Representative of Dominican Republic

Representative of Cuba

Representative of M. Martelly (Presidential
candidate)

Chief Operating Officer of The Clinton
Foundation

PricewaterhouseCoopers

Mérové-Pierre et Associés Cabinet
d'Experts - Comptables

Hogan Lovells

Exhibit A

Projects

<u>Project Number</u>	<u>Project Description</u>	<u>Implementer</u>	<u>Donor(s)</u>
CN/000192	Housing Finance Facility (HFF)	Development Innovations Group	Clinton Bush Haiti Fund/OPIC
CN/000292	Medical and Surgical Emergency Hospital (construction and management)	MSF France	MSF France
CN/000318	Revegetation and transboundary natural resources management: Phase I Masacre and Pedernales rivers watersheds	Haitian and Dominican Ministries of Environment	Government of Norway
CN/000358	Improving Maternal and Child Health Services in Upper Artibonite	Centre de Coopération Internationale en Santé et Développement	Canada; CCISD
CN/000359	Medical and Surgical Emergency Hospital	MSF France	MSF France
CN/000373	Development of Milk Production and Transformation in Haiti	Ministry of Agriculture, Natural Resources and Rural Development	N/A
CN/000397	Housing and Neighbourhoods Reconstruction Support	UN joint programme	UNDP, Ministry of Planning
CN/000382	Haiti - Emergency Medical Care Development Program	International Medical Corps	Clinton Bush Haiti Fund

Exhibit B

Board Members' Comments on Projects

Comments received from:

Mr. Pierre Duquesne (France)
Dr. Jean Réналd Clérismé (Executive Branch of the GOH)
Ms. Rebeca Grynspan (UNDP)
Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste (Haitian NGOs)

General comments

- Mr. Pierre Duquesne: Having been one of the first to suggest that the IHRC should not limit itself to the review and analysis of the projects but should also have strategic discussions, Mr. Duquesne can only be satisfied when time is allocated to that purpose. He fears, however, that the IHRC has fallen into the opposite extreme and regrets that the Board cannot find an hour on its agenda Monday to discuss the eight projects sent "in writing" on Wednesday morning (European time) with modifications and changes made to said projects on Friday night at 19:15 Paris time. Furthermore the documents submitted remain insufficient and were submitted too late. Mr. Duquesne reminded us that Mr. Moloney had suggested that Board members receive more detailed records such as those transmitted by the HRF, a request which seems essential. Mr. Duquesne also questions the financing of the recurring costs of health projects.
- Dr. Jean Réналd Clérismé: is concerned by the fact that four of the eight projects are health projects, and there is no education project.
- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: My comments have expressed great interest in ongoing projects as well as my reservations about the wording of some of them on their reconciliation with the realities they propose to enhance. My recommendations emphasize on taking into account the existing realities in different sectors.

Specific comments

CN/000192 – HOUSING FINANCE FACILITY

- Mr. Pierre Duquesne: The project financing mechanism seems costly and unclear. This subject, as indicated several times by Mr. Boulos, deserves a general debate.
- Ms. Rebeca Grynspan: While it addresses two of the main triggers for the recovery of earthquake-affected areas (housing and micro-finance), this proposal could be more specific in describing the way in which it will develop linkages with Haitian institutions: financial, public, private and informal. This may well help to indicate how the long-term sustainability of the project is envisaged from the outset, particularly in an economic context that is quite unpredictable and vulnerable.

CN/000292 –MEDICAL AND SURGICAL EMERGENCY HOSPITAL

- Mr. Pierre Duquesne: questions the financing of the recurring costs of health projects.

- Ms. Rebeca Grynspar: Both projects are geared towards the construction and operation of hospitals in Port-au-Prince (one temporary structure and a permanent one). Besides the recommendations formulated by the IHRC Secretariat, PAHP/WHO highlighted the need to ensure that “Safe Hospitals” guidelines are used for evaluation and construction of both hospitals.
- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: Preliminary comments to share with officials of the Ministry of Health:
 - We cannot continue to negotiate for reconstruction projects, construction and rehabilitation of health facilities without the development of a “health map” corresponding to a draft framework law, defined by the MSPP. The health map is essential to address the deficiencies and disparities faced by the national health system (Anwar Cherkaoui 2010).
 - We must decentralize the West department adequately to distribute more equitable health infrastructure throughout the country. Departments Nippes, Great Cove, North East, North West require more attention. In my point of view, urgent finalization of the health map is the most effective way to solve this problem.

CN/000297 – PROJECT OF CONTINUING MEDICAL TRAINING AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN HAITI

- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: There is a lack of relevant elements in terms of basic information for us in this project in order to articulate a fair assessment: Number of professionals covered by this training? Determining criteria or document used for medical human resources gap to justify this project?
 - Recommendations:
 - The Rector of the University of Haiti and the Faculties of Medicine should be involved in this project in collaboration with the MSSP for inclusion in the implementation plan and to implement a shared vision to address human resource needs. The Support Project for Capacity Building in Health Management in Haiti conducted a study on the census of Human Resources for Haiti 2006-2012. The analysis and projection of this study could assist in this project.
 - It would have been interesting to link the project with the Tripartite Commission cooperation between Cuba, Brazil and Haiti in strengthening the national health system in Haiti to avoid interventions dispersed. I refer here to project #3, passed 17 August 2010: Health - Strengthening the health system and epidemiological surveillance in Haiti.

CN/000318 - REVEGETATION AND TRANSBOUNDARY NATURAL RESOURCES MANAGEMENT

- Dr. Jean Réналd Clérismé: expresses reservations.

CN/000335 - SHARING CAPACITY FOR COMMUNITY REDEVELOPMENT IN HAITI

- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: No disagreement with the vision of community participation

generated by the project, however:

- There is already a major project, approved by the IHRC 17 August 2010, underway in Martissant. This is project #12 of the meeting of 17 August 2010: housing development in old neighborhoods of Port-au-Prince, focusing first on Martissant and Baillergeau (AIQIP Program).
- Recommendations to share with CIAT:
- Avoid any duplication in the area of Martissant through harmonization of the execution of both projects.
- The eighth section of communal Martissant is broad, it would be important to map the sites of intervention to better identify areas likely to be affected by the two interventions. What are the strategies for implementation that will be used in conjunction with these projects to avoid any possible duplication? Is there already a master plan for the rehabilitation of the eighth section of Martissant? If yes, what is the role of the mayor of Port-au-Prince in monitoring the implementation of this master plan in conjunction with CIAT?

CN/000358 - IMPROVING MATERNAL AND CHILD HEALTH SERVICES IN UPPER ARTIBONITE

- Ms. Rebeca Grynspar: This project plans to improve the infrastructure, training and equipment for nine maternity clinics offering emergency obstetric and neonatal care and for seven community health centers offering basic services for children under five through collaboration between Canada, the Ministry of Health and the Artibonite Health Directorate. WHO/PAHO noted that there are potential synergies with the project "Increase Access to Health Services in Haiti" also financed by Canada, which will be covering up to 90 hospitals and 200 primary health care facilities. It is also important to harmonize approaches and coordinate with the Gonaives departmental hospital, currently under construction.
- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: Health map is necessary. Needs involvement of the Ministry of Women's Status and Rights of Women in monitoring the implementation of this project. Involvement is also needed from women's organizations in the region of the upper Artibonite to monitor project implementation.
 - Suggestion relevant to the project's sustainability beyond five years: Creating a school of midwives in Artibonite to fill the short and medium term human resource deficit of specialists in the field. This school nearby would be a place of exchange between carriers and traditional midwives – those formed in conventional manner and conventional. Quebec has developed an expertise in creating home births with traditional midwives. It would have been really useful to have a technology transfer of these model home births akin to the ritual of childbirth at home Haiti.

CN/000359 - MEDICAL AND SURGICAL MODULAR EMERGENCY HOSPITAL

- M. Pierre Duquesne: finds the project description is too short to be able to comment on it.
- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: Similar concerns as raised with respect to CN/000292 above. The health map is a strategic element. It must define the components of healthcare

delivery at the national level, types of infrastructure and health standards and conditions of their territorial location. It must be established on the basis of a global analysis of existing health care delivery, geo-demographic data, and epidemiological data. It allows a clear vision of the geographic distribution of physicians by region, city, district and village. It allows mapping of all existing public health infrastructure and private (Anwar Cherkaoui 2010).

- Recommendations:
- MSPP should seek technical support from CIAT and CNIGS to accelerate finalization of the development process of the health map.
- Negotiate another site with the MSF for the construction of this hospital. This construction must be entered in the context of strengthening public health infrastructure.

CN/000373 - PRODUCTION AND PROCESSING OF MILK IN HAITI

- Ms. Rebeca Grynspan: The project foresees the creation of 30 milk-processing plants (six of them with cheese production units) managed by farmer organizations; milk and cheese to be sold to school feeding programs. FAO welcomes this project as this type of initiatives is key for the transition from emergency to recovery. It also addresses an important issue, which is the insufficient production of milk in the country. This project is similar to one that is being implemented by WFP and FAO with Brazilian funding (USD 5.5 million for three years). FAO focuses on increasing the production of milk, while WFP focuses on buying that same milk for the school feeding activities that are part of the national programme. Funding was received last week, and the UN project is expected to start in March 2011. One additional point stressed by FAO is that distribution of milk in schools is still very insufficient, so hopefully this kind of project will have a positive impact on the distribution of milk in schools.
- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: 100% agree with this project
Strengthening food security + + +
Strengthening the social economy of the peasants + + +

CN/000378 – LOCAL GOVERNANCE FOR RISK AND DISASTER MANAGEMENT IN HAITI

- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: Very interesting approach to decentralization, however, the Directorate of Local Authorities and Directorate of Civil Defense must play a more active role in this project. The role of the DCP cannot be confined to the validation of training materials. The DPC and the Directorate of Local Authorities should accompany the whole process of project implementation.

CN/000382 - HAITI EMERGENCY MEDICAL CARE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

- Ms. Rebeca Grynspan: This project aims to improve the quality of emergency care at the State University of Haiti through an Emergency Medicine Center of Excellence. WHO/PAHO suggested that the project budget should be clarified, as it seems high for the training of trainers, according to Haiti's standards. Strong consultation and coordination is required with the Ministry of Health and all stakeholders, including the French Cooperation and Brazil/Cuba/Haiti, who have recently signed a tripartite agreement on the training of human resources for health.

CN/000397 - HOUSING AND NEIGHBORHOOD RECONSTRUCTION SUPPORT PROGRAM

- Dr. Jean Réнал Clérismé: This project has to be accompanied by an urban plan.
- Mr. Pierre Duquesne: raises questions about the governance of this programme.

CB/000408 – PLAN FOR PREVENTION OF EARTHQUAKES IN THE GRAND NORD

- Ms. Rose-Anne Auguste: 100% agree with this project. It is urgent that we implement a practical strategy to find funds for its implementation.
 - Recommendation:
 - I strongly suggest that the National Center for Geospatial Information (CNIGS) be included in the process of implementing this project.